The Power of One:

Balancing Human Intelligence and Artificial Intelligence in College and Career Counseling

Rebeca Shackleford
January 2026

All4Ed

Our young people will inherit a world that is at once ever-expanding and increasingly small. Their access to opportunity, innovation, and careers that were once just the stuff of science fiction is now real, all while their access to others half a block or half a world away has grown exponentially. As a result, their need for meaningful college and career counseling and navigation support in our nation's high schools is more pressing than ever. However, the very technology that has created these unprecedented opportunities has also generated a seductive illusion: that algorithms and artificial intelligence can replace the human wisdom, empathy, and connection that have always been at the heart of practical guidance.

In an age of increasing technological sophistication, the power of one trusted adult in a young person's life remains irreplaceable. While artificial intelligence (AI) can deliver information and streamline processes, it cannot build relationships, foster cultural understanding, or cultivate authentic belief in potential that transforms students' trajectories, especially for those from systemically marginalized communities.

As we work to build more equitable pathways systems across the country, we must resist the temptation to substitute technological efficiency for human connection. Instead, we need to invest in ensuring that every student has access to at least one trusted adult in their school setting who can guide them through the complex landscape of postsecondary options.

Current Counseling Crisis

The numbers tell a sobering story. The **average student-to-school counselor** ratio in the United States is 376:1, which is well above the American School Counselor Association's recommended ratio of 250:1. In schools serving higher percentages of students of color and students from low-income backgrounds, these ratios are often even more dire. Counselors are stretched thin addressing mental health crises, managing administrative tasks, and fulfilling noncounseling duties, leaving precious little time for sustained, personalized college and career guidance.

The result is a lottery of opportunity. Students in well-resourced schools receive individualized guidance that helps them navigate the increasingly complex pathways to postsecondary success. Meanwhile, their peers in underserved communities often have limited access to information about college options, career pathways, financial aid, and work-based learning opportunities. This disparity perpetuates systemic inequities and leaves our nation's most vulnerable young people unprepared for a rapidly evolving economy.

Into this crisis have stepped technology companies, promising scalable solutions. While AI-powered platforms hold real value, they also pose a significant risk: in our rush to solve the counselor shortage at scale, we will sacrifice the very element that makes guidance transformative, authentic human connection

Unique Value of Human Intelligence in Counseling

At its core, effective college and career counseling is not about information delivery; it is about transformation through relationship. While AI systems can provide lists and data, they cannot replicate what happens when a young person sits across from a trusted adult who truly sees them, believes in them, and helps them envision possibilities they may never have considered.

Emotional Intelligence and Relationship-Building

The foundation of transformative guidance is trust, built through consistent human interaction over time. A pathways counselor who knows a student's story, their family circumstances, hidden talents, fears, and disappointments, can tailor guidance in ways no algorithm can match. This counselor recognizes when reluctance to apply to a program stems from fear of failure, or when apparent apathy masks a more profound sense that college "isn't for people like me." These subtle human dynamics require emotional intelligence that remains uniquely human.

Cultural Responsiveness and Contextual Understanding

Effective counseling demands deep cultural competence and the ability to navigate complex intersections of identity, opportunity, and systemic barriers. A skilled counselor understands that first-generation students need different support than their peers whose parents attended college, and that undocumented students face unique challenges requiring specialized knowledge and sensitive handling.

Counselors understand local context; they know which employers offer quality internships, which colleges have strong support systems, and which pathways have worked well for similar students. This contextual wisdom, built over years through relationships, cannot be replicated by even the most sophisticated AI system.

Power of Belief: How Expectations Shape Outcomes

The most profound impact of a trusted counselor lies in their ability to see and call forth potential that

students may not recognize in themselves. **Research consistently demonstrates** that adult expectations significantly influence student outcomes. When a counselor believes in a student's ability to succeed, and communicates that belief through encouragement, high expectations, and concrete support, it fundamentally alters the student's sense of what is possible.

Implicit bias and low expectations are significant barriers preventing high-achieving Black and Latino students from accessing advanced coursework, even when they demonstrate readiness. A human counselor can work actively to counteract these biases, while an AI system may inadvertently perpetuate them through historical data patterns.

> ❝ **At its core, effective college and career counseling is not about information delivery; it is about transformation through relationship.**

Building Social Capital Through Authentic Relationships

Students from well-resourced backgrounds often have extensive networks providing informal mentorship, internship opportunities, and insider knowledge. For students without these built-in networks, a trusted counselor serves as a bridge to social capital. They make personal introductions, write compelling recommendation letters that go beyond checkbox assessments, advocate for students with admissions offices and potential employers, and leverage their professional networks on behalf of their students. These relationship-based interventions—personal, contextualized, and rooted in genuine knowledge of the student—create opportunities that no automated system can generate.

Adapting to the Unexpected

Human counselors pivot in real time as circumstances change. When a family crisis threatens college plans, when a student discovers a new passion, when an unexpected opportunity arises, when a rejection letter lands, these moments demand adaptive, emotionally intelligent responses that acknowledge the full humanity of the student. This nuanced, responsive guidance requires human judgment that synthesizes complex information and makes decisions and recommendations not just on data but also on wisdom, experience, and genuine care.

Limitations of Artificial Intelligence in Counseling

Technology plays a valuable role in supporting college and career pathways. The question is not whether technology should be part of the solution, but whether it can, or should, replace the human counselor. The answer, unequivocally, is no.

What AI Can Do Well

Artificial intelligence excels at information processing, pattern recognition, and consistency at scale. An AI system can do the following well:

- **Provide comprehensive databases** of colleges, programs, and scholarships
- **Administer career interest assessment**s and generate instant results
- **Send automated reminders** about application deadlines and required documents
- **Answer frequently** asked questions about admissions or financial aid
- **Flag students** who may be falling behind based on data indicators
- **Translate materials** into multiple languages for accessibility

These capabilities are genuinely helpful. They free up counselors' time for relationship-building work and ensure basic information reaches all students consistently.

What AI Cannot Do

The limitations of artificial intelligence in counseling are fundamental, not merely technical challenges. An AI system cannot do the following:

AI cannot build genuine trust. Trust emerges from an authentic relationship, from being known, from experiencing consistent care over time, from witnessing someone invest in your success even when you doubt yourself. An AI system, no matter how sophisticated, cannot form the kind of reciprocal relationship that creates trust. Students know the difference between interacting with a program and connecting with a person who genuinely cares.

AI cannot understand cultural nuance and context. While an AI system can be programmed with cultural information and process multiple languages, it cannot understand the nuanced, lived experience of

Photo from **EDUImages**

navigating identity, culture, and systemic barriers. It cannot recognize unspoken hesitations of a first-generation student whose family is ambivalent about college, or understand specific dynamics facing an undocumented student, or sense when cultural expectations create internal conflict. Human counselors bring experiences, cultural knowledge, and empathy that remain beyond an AI system's capabilities.

AI cannot recognize hidden potential. AI systems analyze students based on historical data, grades, test scores, demographics, and stated interests. But transformative counseling often involves seeing potential that is not yet reflected in data. A human counselor might recognize that low grades stem from working 30 hours per week to support the family, not from a lack of ability, and can advocate accordingly. They might see leadership potential in a quiet student who would not register in algorithms, or recognize that apparent lack of direction reflects being overwhelmed by choices, not lack of motivation.

AI cannot recognize algorithmic bias. Perhaps most concerning is how AI systems perpetuate and amplify existing inequities. Machine learning algorithms are trained on historical data reflecting historical inequities. Suppose Black and Latino students have historically been underrepresented in specific fields. In that case, an AI system might be less likely to recommend these pathways to similar students, effectively steering them away from opportunities where they could excel. An AI system, trained on historical patterns, might suggest "realistic" pathways based on what students "like them" have done in the past, rather than pushing them toward high-opportunity fields where they are currently underrepresented.

AI cannot provide emotional support and crisis response. College and career planning does not happen in a vacuum. Students face setbacks, disappointments, family crises, mental health challenges, and self-doubt. A human counselor can recognize when a conversation about college applications needs to pause because a student is in distress. They can provide emotional support, connect students with additional resources, or simply listen with compassion. An AI system cannot read body language, sense when something is wrong beneath surface-level responses, or provide human presence that helps someone feel less alone.

AI cannot advocate for students and provide relationship-based intervention. Human counselors do some of their most powerful work outside of direct student interactions, such as making phone calls to postsecondary education admissions offices to advocate for exceptional circumstances, connecting personally with local employers to create internship opportunities, or writing recommendation letters that capture not just what a student has achieved but who they are and what they are capable of becoming. These interventions require social capital, professional networks, and human-to-human connections that cannot be automated.

The Power of One Trusted Adult

The **research** is unequivocal: having at least one caring, consistent adult in a young person's life can alter their entire trajectory. This relationship does not require perfection or extraordinary resources; it simply requires genuine care, consistent presence, and belief in the young person's potential.

Study after study demonstrates that supportive relationships with nonparental adults significantly improve outcomes for young people, particularly those facing adversity. Students with at least one trusted adult advocate are more likely to graduate from high school, enroll in postsecondary education, persist through challenges, and report higher well-being and life satisfaction. For students from low-income backgrounds or students of color who may face systemic barriers and bias, having an adult who sees past stereotypes and believes in their capabilities can be genuinely transformative.

Consider the student who has never known anyone who attended a four-year university. To them, college may seem like a foreign world, inaccessible and not "for people like me." A trusted counselor might say, "I can absolutely see you thriving in a college engineering program. Let me tell you about schools with strong support systems for first-generation students, and I'll connect you with an alumna from our school who had a similar background and is now working in aerospace engineering."

That single conversation, rooted in genuine knowledge of the student and backed by the counselor's belief and practical support, can fundamentally shift what the student believes is possible. The counselor is not just providing information (which the student could theoretically find online); they are providing personalized guidance, social capital through an introduction, and most importantly, the implicit message that "I believe you belong in this space, and I'm going to help you get there."

The tragic reality is that the "power of one" is not currently distributed equitably. Students in well-resourced schools often have not just one but multiple trusted adults guiding their pathways.

Meanwhile, students in underserved schools may have no one, or may share a single overwhelmed counselor with hundreds of other students.

Creating equitable pathways means ensuring that every student, regardless of zip code or family income, has access to at least one trusted adult who can provide the guidance, belief, advocacy, and connection that transform lives. This is not a luxury; it is a fundamental requirement for educational equity and economic mobility. This is a goal we can achieve, not through technology alone, but through the deliberate choice to invest in human relationships and the professionals who build them.

Building a System That Values Human Connection

Acknowledging the irreplaceable value of human connection is the first step; building systems that protect and prioritize this connection is the essential next step. This requires deliberate policy choices, adequate funding, and a commitment to resisting the allure of technological "solutions" that promise efficiency at the cost of effectiveness.

Federal policy should establish clear expectations and provide funding to move toward counselor-to-student ratios that enable relationship-based counseling. The solution is not to replace school counselors but to augment them with dedicated pathways counselors, professionals whose sole focus is guiding students through college and career decisions, working in conjunction with grade-level counselors and mental health professionals.

Technology should be deployed strategically to free up counselors' time for relationship-building, not to substitute for human interaction. The measure of a good technology tool should be: "Does this give counselors more time and better information to do the irreplaceable human work?" If technology is positioned as a replacement for counselor-student interaction, it should be viewed with skepticism.

Bottom Line

Technology should be a tool that augments human counselors' capacity; it should not be a replacement that reduces guidance to information transactions. The most effective pathways systems

will leverage technology strategically to handle information delivery, routine communications, and administrative tasks, while protecting and prioritizing the time counselors need for irreplaceable work, such as building relationships, providing culturally responsive guidance, and helping each student chart a course that reflects their unique potential and aspirations.

As we stand at the intersection of unprecedented technological capability and persistent educational inequity, we face a critical choice. We can pursue the seductive promise of scalable, efficient, technology-driven solutions that reach every student but truly connect with none. Or we can make the more difficult but more transformative choice: invest in human relationships that have always been, and will always be, at the heart of meaningful guidance.

The **evidence** is clear. One nonparental trusted adult can change a young person's life trajectory. A counselor who sees potential where others see obstacles, who believes in students when they doubt themselves, who opens doors through personal

connections and advocacy, who provides sustained support through setbacks, is irreplaceable. No algorithm can replicate this person, no matter how sophisticated.

The current reality, where access to comprehensive, relationship-based college and career counseling depends on zip code and family income, is unconscionable. This is not a resource constraint we must accept. This is a choice that reflects our priorities and values. When we choose to fund technology platforms rather than hire counselors, we choose efficiency over effectiveness. When we accept counselor-to-student ratios of 385:1 or higher, we assume that most students will not receive the guidance they deserve.

We can make different choices. We can choose to invest in people, not just platforms. We can ensure every high school has dedicated pathways counselors with manageable caseloads and time to build meaningful relationships. We can choose to direct resources to schools and communities with the greatest needs. We can choose equity.

In an era of artificial intelligence, big data, and algorithmic decision-making, the most powerful force in a young person's educational journey remains profoundly human: the trusted relationship with one adult who sees them, believes in them, and helps them navigate toward their future. This is the power of one, and ensuring that every student experiences it is both our greatest challenge and our most important obligation.

The choice before us is clear. We can continue down a path where technology substitutes for human connection and counseling remains a privilege for some. Or we can choose to build a system where every student benefits from the transformative power of one trusted adult guide. Our young people, and our nation's future, deserve nothing less.

🐦 @All4Ed   f facebook.com/All4ed

The Alliance for Excellent Education (All4Ed) is a Washington, DC–based national policy, practice, and advocacy organization dedicated to ensuring that all students, particularly those underperforming and those historically underserved, graduate from high school ready for success in college, work, and citizenship. **all4ed.org**